

(11) Irving Ladimer, Roger W Newman (1963)

Clinical investigation in medicine: legal, ethical and moral aspects: an anthology and bibliography

Boston University: Law-Medicine Research Institute

Preamble

The emphasis of this comprehensive book is on the legal, ethical, and moral aspects of clinical research. However it also includes sections on clinical trials and experimental design.

Aims

In the last half century, and especially since World War II, a greatly expanding effort in medical research has been occurring in the United States and abroad. Vast numbers of studies have been undertaken to learn more about the human body and its functions, about diseases and their treatments, and about the maintenance of health in its broadest sense. In relatively recent times we have witnessed the development of experimental medicine as a specialized discipline, concerned with a widening scope of novel procedures, therapeutics, and prophylactics, being tested according to extremely sophisticated statistical methods. Along with the growth of the science itself has come the need for the development of its philosophy, its ethic, its superego. At a time when most of the world has accepted the scientific method, or at least accepted its fruits and allowed it to exist in order to produce them, science must repeatedly demonstrate its conscience. In this book, and for the first time, are gathered some of the most important contributions to the philosophy of human testing in clinical medical research (Foreword, page iii).

Contents (xxiii+517 pages)

Foreword (William J Curran)

Part I: Anthology

Acknowledgements

Authors

Editorial note

Chapter 1: Historical and Ethical Perspective

A. Introduction

B. Medical ethics and medical history

Experimentation in man (Henry K Beecher)

The history and ethics of the use of human subjects in medical experiments

(AC Ivy)

The practice of experimental medicine (RA McCance)

The problem of experimentation on human beings

The research worker's point of view (Michael B Shimkin)

The physician's point of view (Otto E Guttentag)

Human experimentation (Hugh Clegg)

Let each new patient be a complete experience (Walter Modell)

C. Perspectives of other disciplines

Research with human subjects (Dael Wolfle)

The human study of human beings (Margaret Mead)

Some social and cultural factors in American society conducive to medical

research on human subjects (Renée C Fox)

- Limits for experimentation (Edmond Cahn)
- Chapter 2: Codifications and principles
- A. Introduction
 - B. The “Nuremburg Code”: United States versus Karl Brandt *et al* (Nuremburg Military Tribunal)
 - C. Commentary on the “Nuremburg Code”
 - Human experimentation as exemplified by the career of Dr William Beaumont (Carl J Wiggers)
 - Reflections on the problems of human experimentation (Louis C Welt)
 - Some fallacies and errors in the application of the principle of consent in human experimentation (Henry K Beecher)
 - Report on the national conference on the legal environment of medical science
 - Committee on legal battery and clinical research (Nathan Hershey)
 - Committee for norms for testing new drugs in human subjects (LB Hobson)
 - Committee on re-evaluation of the Nuremburg experimental principles (Irving Ladimer)
 - D. American codifications
 - Requirements for experiments on human beings
 - American Medical Association
 - Guiding principles in medical research involving humans, National Institutes of Health (Stuart M Sessoms)
 - Ethical standards of psychologists (American Psychological Association)
 - Ethical and religious directives for Catholic hospitals (Catholic Hospital Association)
 - E. Foreign and international codifications
 - Memorandum on clinical investigations (British Medical Research Council)
 - Report on human experimentation (Public Health Council of the Netherlands)
 - Draft code of ethics on human experimentation (World Medical Association)
 - Principles for those in research and experimentation (World Medical Association)
 - Article seven, draft covenant on civil and political rights (United Nations)
 - Experimental research on human beings (Appendix) (British Medical Association)
- Chapter 3: Legal review and analysis
- A. Introduction
 - B. General legal commentary
 - Medical malpractice: what about experimentation? (Elwyn L Cady)
 - Ethical and legal aspects of medical research on human beings (Irving Ladimer)
 - Some particular duties of medical practitioners (Allan H McCoid)
 - Consent to experimental medical procedures, failure to follow standard procedures (Burke W Shartel, Marcus L Plant)
 - Medical experimentation (C Joseph Stetler, Alan R Moritz)
 - C. Special legal problems
 - Limits of the right of a person to consent to experimentation on himself (Alexander M Kidd)
 - A problem of consent: kidney transplantation in minors (William J Curran)

Legal implications of psychological research with human subjects
(Donald P Dietrich)

The physician's legal responsibility in clinical testing of new drugs
(Patricia Hatry)

Chapter 4: Religious and moral commentary

A. Introduction

B. Religious statements

Human experimentation – a world problem from the standpoint of spiritual leaders (Bosio M Giuseppe (Roman Catholic)), Jacques De Senaens (Protestant), JJ Groen (Jewish))

The moral limits of medical research and treatment (Pope Pius XII)

Human experimentation in medicine: moral aspects (John J Lynch)

C. Medical ethics and morality

Moral responsibility in clinical research (DM Jackson)

A testament of duty: some strictures on moral responsibilities in clinical research
(William Bennett Bean)

Chapter 5: Clinical drug trials

A. Introduction

B. Legislation and regulation

New drugs legislation: section 505, Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act

New drug regulations: section 130.3, Regulations of the Food and Drug Administration

Drug panic and its aftermath (Louis C Lasagna)

Patient consent provisions of the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act
(Frances O Kelsey)

Developmental aspects of biologics under the Division of Biologics Standards
(Roderick Murray)

The new drug amendments of 1962 and the new drug regulations – comments
from a drug industry physician (JK Weston)

C. Clinical pharmacology

The transfer of drugs from the animal laboratory to man (DR Laurence)

Problems in clinical evaluation of drug therapy (Mindel C Sheps)

Statement of principles involved in the use of investigational drugs in hospitals
(American Hospital Association)

Chapter 6: Scientific design and technique

A. Introduction

B. Medical ethics

Medical ethics and controlled trials (Sir Austin Bradford Hill)

C. Scientific commentary

The clinical trial – some difficulties and suggestions (Donald Mainland)

Experimental design in clinical medicine (Paul Martini)

Research techniques in the study of human beings (William G Cochran)

Chapter 7: Research subjects

A. Introduction

B. Patient-subjects

Patient reaction to the teaching and research situation (Julius B Richmond)

The Patients' Association (John Gale)

Does clinical research interfere with treatment? (Harold A Rashkis)

C. "Normal" volunteers

Obtaining subjects for research (Ewart E Smith)

Biologic and medical studies in human volunteer subjects; ethics and safeguards (Francis D Moore)

Research in human subjects and the artificial traumatic neurosis: where does our responsibility lie? (Bernard Bressler, Albert J Silverman, Sanford I Cohen, Barry Shmavonian)

The volunteer subject in research (Louis Lasagna, John M von Felsinger)

The experimental subject: the psychiatric evaluation and selection of a volunteer population (Seymour Perlin, William Pollin, Robert N Butler)

Clinical profiles of paid normal subjects volunteering for hallucinogen drug studies (Harold Escover, Sidney Malitz, Bernard Wilkens)

D. Prisoners

Ethics governing the service of prisoners as subjects in medical experiments (Governor Green's Committee)

Resolutions on disapproval of participation in scientific experiments by inmates of penal institutions (American Medical Association)

The participation of prisoners in clinical research (Roger W Newman)

Capital punishment or capital gain (Jack Kevorkian)

E. Military personnel

Civil rights of military personnel regarding medical care and experimental procedures (WH Johnson)

Clinical investigation in naval hospitals (Howard T Karsner)

F. Children

The study of child behavior and development; ethical problems of research (Alfred L Baldwin)

Implicit and explicit values in science as related to human growth and development (Nancy Bayley)

Part II: Bibliography

Editorial note

References

Appendix: Experimental research on human beings; British Medical Association

Authors

The Editors are Irving Ladimer SJD (Vice President and Director, Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Division, National Better Business Bureau, New York, NY, USA) and Roger W Newman LLD (Research Attorney, Law-Medicine Research Institute, Boston University Boston, MA, USA). The foreword is by William J Curran LLM, SMHyg (Utley Professor of Legal Medicine, and Director, Law-Medicine Research Institute, Boston University, Boston, MA, USA).

The authors are Alfred L Baldwin PhD (Professor and Chairman, Department of Child Development and Family Relationships, Cornell University, and New York State College of Home Economics, Ithaca, NY); Nancy Bayley PhD (Chief, Section on Early Development, Laboratory of Psychology, National Institute of Mental Health, Bethesda, MD); William Bennett

Bean MD (Professor and Chairman, Department of Internal Medicine, State University of Iowa, and Physician-in-Chief, University Hospitals, Iowa); Henry K Beecher MD (Dorr Professor of Research in Anaesthesia, Harvard Medical School, and Anaesthetist-in-Chief and Director, Anaesthesia Laboratory, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, MA); Bernard Bressler MD (Associate Professor of Psychiatry, Duke University Medical Center, Durham, NC); Robin N Butler MD (Faculty Member, Washington School of Psychiatry, Washington DC); Elwyn L Cady LLB, BSMed (Medico-legal Consultant, Kansas City, MO); Edmund Cahn JD (Professor of Law, New York University School of Law, New York, NY); Hugh Clegg MD (Editor, *British Medical Journal*, London, England); William G Cochran MA (Professor of Statistics, Department of Statistics, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA); Sanford I Cohen MD (Assistant Professor of Psychiatry and Co-Director, Psychophysiology Laboratory, Duke University Medical Center, Durham, NC); Jacques De Senarclens (Pastor and Director, Protestant Center of Studies, Geneva, Switzerland); Donald P Dietrich LLB (Formerly Associate Editor, *Duke Law Journal*, Duke University School of Law, Durham, NC); Harold Esecover MD (Research Psychiatrist, Department of Experimental Psychiatry, New York State Psychiatric Institute, New York, NY); Renée C Fox PhD (Assistant Professor of Sociology, Barnard College, and Research Associate, Bureau of Applied Social Research, Columbia University, New York, NY); John Gale (Reporter, The Observer Ltd, London, England); Bosio M Giuseppe SJ (Reverend and Doctor of Biology, Rome, Italy); JJ Groen (Professor, Department of Medicine, Hadassah Hebrew University School of Medicine and Hospital, Jerusalem, Israel); Otto E Guttentag MD (Hahnemann Associate Professor of Medicine, University of California Medical School, San Francisco, CA); Patricia Hatry LLB (Attorney, Davis, Gilbert, Levine and Schwartz, New York, NY); Nathan Hershey LLB (Assistant Director, Health Law Center, Graduate School of Public Health, University of Pittsburgh, PA); Sir Austin Bradford Hill CBE, DSc, PhD (Professor of Medical Statistics, University of London, London, England); Lawrence B Hobson MD, PhD (Medical Director, Squibb Institute for Medical Research, New York, NY); Andrew C Ivy MD, DSc (Roosevelt University, Chicago, IL); Douglas MacG. Jackson MD (Medical Research Council, Birmingham, England); WH Johnson (Judge Advocate Corps, United States Army); Howard T Karsner MD (Medical Research Advisor to the Surgeon General, Bureau of Medicine and Surgery, Department of the Navy, Washington, DC); Frances O Kelsey PhD, MD (Chief, Investigational Drug Branch, Division of New Drugs, Bureau of Medicine, Food and Drug Administration, Washington, DC); Jack Kevorkian MD (Pontiac General Hospital, Pontiac, Mich); Alexander M Kidd LLB (Deceased, formerly Professor of Law, University of California School of Law, Berkeley, CA); Louis C Lasagna MD (Associate Professor of Medicine and Associate Professor of Pharmacology and Experimental Therapeutics, Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD); DR Laurence MD (Professor and Chairman, Department of Applied Pharmacology, University College and Medical Unit, University College Hospital Medical School, London, England); John J Lynch SJ (Professor of Moral Theology, Weston College, Weston, MA); Donald Mainland MB, ChB, DSc (Professor of Medical Statistics, New York University Medical Center, New York, NY); Sidney Malitz MD (Assistant Clinical Professor of Psychiatry, Columbia University College of Physicians and Surgeons, New York, NY and Acting Principal Research Psychiatrist, Department of Experimental Psychiatry, New York State Psychiatric Institute, New York, NY); Paul Martini MD (Professor and Chairman, Department of Medicine, University of Bonn, Bonn, Germany); RA McCance MA, MD, PhD (Professor and Chairman, Department of Experimental Medicine, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, England); Allan H McCoid LLB (Professor of Law, University of Minnesota Law

School, Minneapolis, Minn); Margaret Mead PhD (Associate Curator for Ethnology, American Museum of Natural History, New York, NY); Walter Modell MD (Associate Professor of Pharmacology and Director of Clinical Pharmacology, Cornell University Medical College, New York, NY); Francis D Moore MD (Moseley Professor of Surgery, Harvard Medical School, Surgeon-in-Chief, Peter Bent Brigham Hospital, Boston, MA); Alan R Moritz ScD, MD (Professor of Pathology and Director of the Institute of Pathology, Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio); Roderick Murray MD (Director, Division of Biologics Standards, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MA); Seymour Perlin MD (Chief, Division of Psychiatry, Montefiore Hospital, New York, NY); Marcus L Plant MA, JD (Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School, Ann Arbor, Mich); William Pollin MD (Research Psychiatrist, Laboratory of Clinical Science, National Institute of Mental Health, Bethesda, MA); Harold A Rashkis MD, PhD (Senior Research Psychiatrist, Eastern Pennsylvania Psychiatric Institute, Philadelphia, PA); Julious B Richmond MD (Professor and Chairman, Department of Pediatrics, State University of New York Upstate Medical Center, Syracuse, NY); Stuart M Sessoms MD (Deputy Director, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD); Burke W Shartel SJD (Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School, Ann Arbor, Mich); Mindel C Sheps MD, MPH (Associate Research Professor of Biostatistics, Graduate School of Public Health and Associate Research Professor of Preventive Medicine, School of Medicine, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA), Michael B Shimkin MD (Associate Director of Field Studies, National Cancer Institute, Bethesda, MA); Barry Shmavonian PhD (Psychophysiology Laboratory, Department of Psychiatry, Duke University Medical Center, Durham, NC); Albert J Silverman MD (Associate Professor of Psychiatry, Director, Division of Human Behavior, Department of Psychiatry, and Co-Director, Psychophysiology Laboratory, Duke University Medical Center, Durham, NC); Ewart E Smith PhD (Serendipity Associates, Sherman Oaks, CA); C Joseph Stetler LLM (General Counsel and Executive Vice President, Pharmaceutical Manufacturers Association, Washington, DC); John M von Felsinger PhD (Chief Psychologist, Massachusetts General Hospital, and Research Associate in Psychiatry, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA); Louis G Welt MD (Professor of Medicine, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, NC); JK Weston PhD, MD (Director of Medical Affairs, Burroughs Wellcome & Company Inc, Tuckahoe, NY); Carl J Wiggers MD, ScD (Professor of Physiology, Western Reserve University School of Medicine, Cleveland, Ohio); Bernard Wilkens MD (Research Psychiatrist, Department of Experimental Psychiatry, New York State Psychiatric Institute, New York, NY); and, Dael Wolfle PhD (Executive Officer, American Association for the Advancement of Science, Publisher of *Science*, Washington, DC).